"Whilst we may use edgy humour and memes in the vanguard stage and to attract a young audience, eventually we will need to show the reality of our thoughts".¹

Brenton Tarrant – Gunman in 2019 New Zealand Mosque Shootings

Propaganda has long functioned as a key tool of terrorist movements, and the Far-Right’s consistently “innovative” use of online space, particularly Web 2.0, has unlocked a new digital sphere for the dissemination of image-based messaging.²,³ This essay will heed Massimo Leone’s “urgent” recommendation for a semiotic consideration of online propaganda which is grounded in an “unconventional reading of contemporaneity”, by analysing the emerging use of internet memes as propaganda by the Far-Right.⁴ Memes will here be defined as the “highly medium-specific”, user-generated vehicles through which “arguments” are created by the “intertextual” relationship between image and text.⁵,⁶ In short, internet memes are “small cultural units of transmission”.⁷ Rather than attempting to provide a comprehensive overview of terrorists’ various uses of propaganda, this essay will instead focus specifically on the strategic deployment of memes by online Far-Right

---

³ Alice Marwick and Rebecca Lewis “Media Manipulation and Disinformation Online” Data Society (2017) pp.1-104 available https://datasociety.net/pubs/oh/DataAndSociety_MediaManipulationAndDisinformationOnline.pdf p.4
⁷ Lamerichs et al “Elite” p.180
movements to publicize their political ideology, and the forms of identity which engagement with memes fosters. It will be argued that these key functions may encourage individual action on behalf of a larger collective. It will be concluded that memes function as a vehicle of symbolic messaging for Far-Right movements. There is currently very little academic study dedicated solely to the effects of memes within terrorist movements. This essay, therefore, does not attempt to link any specific terrorist acts directly to engagement with memes, but will instead adopt a semiotic lens to examine the wider theoretical effects of memes as propaganda.

The question posed by this essay gives rise to an abundance of definitional complexities that must be briefly clarified before embarking upon analysis. Firstly, it must be recognised that the inherently global nature of online space problematises any definition of terrorism grounded in universal absolutes. Instead, here terrorism will be defined through a social-constructionist lens as a contextually relative “politically motivated tactic involving the threat or use of force or violence in which the pursuit of publicity plays a significant role”.8,9 The Far-Right constitutes a specific articulation of terrorism, however Manuela Caiani and Linda Parenti show that The Far-Right is comprised of a loose association of heterogeneous political nodes, and is therefore difficult to describe as a cohesive ‘movement’.10 Stephanie Hartzell, however, notes that the various factions of Far-Right ideology can be broadly united under an “umbrella of “pro-whiteness”.11 As such, this paper will adhere to Cas

Mudde’s broad characterisation of these groups as linked by their allegiance to idealised authoritarian political systems, ethnic nationalism, and xenophobic attitude. The newly-emerging Alt-Right, will be considered as an anarchic “youthful, intellectual, pro-white” faction of Far-Right ideology which bridges “mainstream public discourse and white nationalism”. Therefore, in contrast to a centralised organisation, the Far-Right generally will be considered as a “leaderless resistance” where individuals may be inspired to carry out “lone-actor” attacks on behalf of the wider movement.

Propaganda, is also a contested concept, and will be examined more closely throughout the course of this essay. However, it will be considered generally as “the deliberate and systematic attempt to shape perceptions, manipulate cognitions, and direct behaviour to achieve a response that furthers the desired intent of the propagandist”. Semiotics, as conceptualised by Clifford Geertz, is the study of “sacred symbols [which] function to synthesize a people’s ethos... and their world view – the picture they have of the way things in sheer actuality are.” As a discipline it theorises that when taken together symbols combine to form “complex systems, named ‘codes’”, to produce an “authoritative story” definitive of a collective’s ontological perspective. As such “reality” is neither neutral nor absolute, but is constituted through the communication and engagement with various

---

13 Hartzell “Alt-White” p.8
16 Clifford Geertz “Religion as a Cultural System” The Interpretation of Cultures 1973 Basic Books, United States, pp.87-125 p.89
18 Geertz “Religion” p.90
“signs and symbols”. Symbols are defined here in the broadest sense as “tangible formulations of notions, abstractions from experience fixed in perceptible forms”. Far-Right movements exemplify this form of symbolic culture construction in their allegiance to traditional culturally loaded “symbols of hate” such as the swastika. Francesco Buscemi suggests that a semiotic lens is particularly well disposed for the analysis of extremist propaganda, which often relies on sets of symbols, and regards human bodies symbolically, to produce “formally structured oppositions”, in the premediated dissemination of divisive ideology.

**Memes as a Form of Publicity**

Philip Taylor states that a central function of propaganda is its ability to disseminate a group’s message and publicize its political ideology. Alice Marwick et al stress that some memes function as “image macros” – “images that quickly convey humour or political thought”, which are engineered to ‘go viral’, and spread key elements of Far-Right ideology to mainstream circles. One such example of this engineered virality is the “Tickle my Pickle” meme (Figure One), which was created within Far-Right online “Scambaiting” communities to visualise white “racial power”.

---

20 Geertz “Religion” 91
22 Buscemi “Edible” p.184
24 Marwick and Lewis “Media” p.36
and skirts, holding another black man between them as they balance white blocks on their heads and hold pickles in their mouths. The original post encouraged users to engage with the motif and provide humorous captions for the photo. The image leverages two key goals of the Far-Right. Firstly, from a semiotic perspective, the black bodies are depicted as an essentialised metaphor for primitiveness - the orchestrated bizarreness of the picture is evocative of traditional white supremacist metaphors of black bodies as “animalistic”, and inherently ‘other’ to superior white bodies. Similarly, the surrealist tone creates intrigue and confusion, which encourages audiences to engage with the image, and share it online, thereby enabling the spread of Far-Right ideology into mainstream circles. As such, memes may elicit the publicization of racialised ideology online by creating an intriguing premise and encouraging interaction.

Moving beyond overtly symbolic racial metaphors, memes may also publicize elements of Far-Right ideology by allowing extreme messages to masquerade as medium-specific parody. For example, the ‘Successful Black Man’ meme (Figure Two) which originated on Alt-Right Reddit forums provides a template of an African-American man in a suit for users

---

26 Nakamura “I WILL DO EVERYthing” p.270
to modify and inject their own sense of humour onto the image. Users create an attention-grabbing headline grounded in a racist stereotype, which is then undermined by the text underneath the image which subverts this premise, in an apparent parody of racial profiling. However, as Ryan Milner argues, “familiarity with racist tropes is necessary to get the joke”.28 Nicole Lamerich et al claim that memes of this sort instead create “a certain awareness of cultural repertoire by imitating it”, thereby confirming stereotypes by making racial differences more salient, rather than dispelling them.29 In this way memes operate under the guise of humour to enable the symbolic categorisation of blackness as ‘other’ and thereby hierarchically inferior to ‘whiteness’, thus propagating the Far-Right’s semiotic construction of reality.

This strategic deployment of humour may also create a “fertile breeding ground” for radicalisation.30 Angela Nagle suggests that parody is a tactic employed by Far-Right movements to shift the “Overton Window” – the general conception of what is considered acceptable public discourse - by using humour to disguise the loaded racism of their messaging.31 This dynamic is heightened when memes are situated within the particularities

---

29 Lamerichs et al “Elite” p.186
31 Angela Nagle “Gramscians of the Alt-Light” *Kill all Normies: Online Culture Wars from 4Chan and Tumblr to Trump and the Alt-Right* (2017) Zero Books, United Kingdom pp.32-41 p.33
of online space. Internet algorithms work in tandem with users’ browsing patterns to personalise their digital experiences by exposing them to similar, mutually affirming content, and thus creating a “filter bubble”.

Therefore, users who interact with memes generated by the Far-Right are increasingly likely to be exposed to similar content. Scot MacDonald shows that propaganda functions most effectively as a recruitment tool when it accords with a viewer’s preconceptions; an assertion strengthened by Alexander Meleagrou-Hitchens et al’s argument that extremist narratives are most successful when they avoid triggering “mental resistance”.

Thus, by shifting the Overton Window, memes create an environment in which “racism, misogyny or Islamophobia is normalised”, which may increase an individual’s receptiveness to extremist narratives which may once have been dispelled as extreme.

Quentin Wiktorowicz identifies this dynamic of increasing receptiveness to extremist narratives as a necessary precursor for radicalisation.

As a form of propaganda, memes may therefore create a normalising environment to enable further extremism.

Memes and Identity Conception

Propaganda also aims to bind actors together in a cohesive in-group, by producing a sense of shared identity.

Emile Durkheim asserts that social cohesion is produced through the

---

37 MacDonald “Psychological” p.42
“collective representations of a “sacred” entity”, which unites subjects in a state of mutual regard. This essay suggests that the notion of ‘Kek’ may fulfil this symbolic role in some Far-Right communities. The term “Kek” emerged as a synonym for ‘laugh out loud’ from online gaming circles and was appropriated by communities on 4chan and Reddit as a “tribal marker of the Alt-Right”. As memes from these communities spread into mainstream circles and were declared hate symbols, members of the Alt-Right parodied this rejection from society by branding themselves as “Kekistanis”, or “Kekfugees” (Figure Three), a fictional minority whose right to free-speech is viewed as being under constant threat. As such ‘Kek’ simultaneously binds members of Alt-Right communities together in their mutual awareness of the sacred nature of free-speech, while also parodying the European refugee crisis.

Furthermore, the very sense of irony with which this identity is created serves to increase group cohesion. Ryan Milner argues that memes generate a sense of inauthenticity whereby antagonistic symbols are disseminated with ambiguous intentions, which allow members of Far-Right communities to consistently mock outsiders, or “normies”, who take these

---


symbols seriously.\textsuperscript{41,42} Ruth Wodak shows that one’s own sense of identity is strengthened when it is juxtaposed against that of an undesirable “out-group”.\textsuperscript{43} Therefore, not only does this irony masque hateful messages, it also acts as a sub-cultural “marker of the elite”, whereby outsiders can be consistently undermined by humour, thus strengthening a sense of in-group cohesion.\textsuperscript{44} In short, memes function as propaganda by fostering a collective identity through the co-definition of sacred symbols and the sense of irony with which these symbols are adopted.

Yet it is not merely the content of memes which impacts actors’ sense of identity. Diane Austin shows that symbols are made meaningful by the ways in which they are interacted with, and therefore it is necessary to examine the forms of sociality that memes foster.\textsuperscript{45} Douglas Walton argues that propaganda must be considered as a form of discourse, where messages are communicated not only externally but also internally.\textsuperscript{46} Similarly, Heide Huntington shows that memes such as Successful Black Man, which invite users to modify the source material to create new jokes, create a community bound in a discourse of co-production.\textsuperscript{47} Thus, memes may foster a culture of “semiotic productivity”, where users are

\textsuperscript{41} Milner “Internet” p.74-77
\textsuperscript{42} Marwick and Lewis “Media” p.36
\textsuperscript{46} Douglas Walton “What is Propaganda, and What Exactly is Wrong with it?” Public Affairs Quarterly Vol.11 No.4 (1997) pp.383-413 p.383
\textsuperscript{47} Huntington “Pepper” p.79
encouraged to engage discursively with texts and images to produce the shared values of their online environment.\textsuperscript{48}

This dynamic of collective production also impacts identity at an individual level. Elizabeth Baeten demonstrates that selfhood is reflexively produced by interactions between actors and their environments, and Donatella Della Porta and Mario Diane suggest that one’s identity is constituted through active engagement with a wider collective.\textsuperscript{49,50} Thus through participating in the collective production of semiotic systems, one’s ontological perspective may converge with that of the collective, producing a “chronic inclination” towards the shared values of a group.\textsuperscript{51} It is this convergence of individual and extreme collective narratives that Quentin Wiktorowicz suggests drives one’s desire to carry out acts of terrorism as a representative of a terrorist movement, as their own identity becomes synonymous with that of the group.\textsuperscript{52} Cristina Archetti, too, suggests that acts of “lone-actor” terrorism are made possible as individuals come to regard the values of a terrorist movement as key markers of their own selfhood.\textsuperscript{53} In short, memes may function as effective propaganda for terrorist movements by encouraging ideological convergence. This convergence may ultimately facilitate the reformulation of individual identity to gradually encourage extremist action on behalf of a wider leaderless resistance.

\textsuperscript{49} Elizabeth Baeten “Rethinking the Socially Constituted Self as the Subject of Ethical Consumption” The Journal of Speculative Philosophy Vol.13 No.1 (1999) pp.1-18 p.6
\textsuperscript{51} Geertz “Religion” p.97-98
\textsuperscript{52} Wiktorowicz “Introduction” p.28
\textsuperscript{53} Cristina Archetti “Terrorism, Communication and New Media: Explaining Radicalisation in the Digital Age” Perspectives on Terrorism Vol.9 No.1 (2015) pp.49-59 p.53
Conclusion

This essay has argued that memes function as propaganda for terrorist movements by attracting individuals to Far-Right political ideology, and by fostering specific articulations of identity. Before concluding it must be briefly acknowledged that the internet-specific contemporaneity and ironic nature of memes means they are often discounted from serious academic consideration, and there is currently very little work which directly considers the impact of memes as a tactic of terrorist movements. This paper has aimed to redress this exclusion from academic discourse by adopting a semiotic lens which recognises memes as a vehicle for the transmission of symbols and ideological frameworks. This lens has elucidated the capacity for memes to act as propaganda in two key ways. By masquerading under the guise of humour, memes enable the spread of Far-Right political ideology into mainstream circles, demonstrating a normalising capacity whereby individuals may regard extreme messages as more politically acceptable. Similarly, the forms of interaction fostered by memes through the co-definition of shared values and collective semiotic production can enable a sense of collective identity, encouraging individuals to act on behalf of a broader movement. Therefore, while it is not currently possible to link the dissemination of internet memes directly to specific terrorist acts, this paper has elucidated how engagement with memes, as a form of propaganda, may foster allegiance with terrorist movements, thereby potentially increasing the likelihood of violent action. In conclusion, this essay has shown that memes cannot be regarded as a neutral form of communication, but must instead be afforded serious academic attention as propaganda for their propensity to spread extremist ideology and their potential to encourage action on behalf of leaderless resistance terrorist movements.
Bibliography


https://www.jstor.org/stable/23159581

https://www.jstor.org/stable/25670273

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/287008298

arXiv:1406.7438v1

DOI: 10.1080/10646170902869544

https://doi.org/10.1177/1750635215618619


DOI: 10.1177/0163443707078428


Geertz, Clifford. “Religion as a Cultural System” The Interpretation of Cultures 1973 Basic Books, United States, pp.87-125


Nagle, Angela. “Gramscians of the Alt-Light” *Kill all Normies: Online Culture Wars from 4Chan and Tumblr to Trump and the Alt-Right* (2017) Zero Books, United Kingdom pp.32-41


Unicorn Riot “Message by FucknOathMate, in Vibrant Diversity, #General” (2017) available


https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2017/may/23/alt-right-online-humor-as-a-weapon-facism last accessed [10/03/19]

List of Figures

Figure One: ‘Tickle My Pickle’ available [http://jawdrops.com/tickle-my-pickle/](http://jawdrops.com/tickle-my-pickle/) last accessed [08/03/19]

Figure Two: An example of the “Successful Black Man” meme available [https://knowyourmeme.com/memes/successful-black-man/photos](https://knowyourmeme.com/memes/successful-black-man/photos) last accessed [08/03/19]

Figure Three: An example of the “Kekfugees” meme available [https://017qndpynhflywheel.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/kek.jpg](https://017qndpynhflywheel.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/10/kek.jpg) last accessed [09/03/19]